

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554 www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs

Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp

Staff: Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, October 15, 2013 – OLD BUSINESS

4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:05 p.m.

Staff in attendance: J. Grieder, HDC Assistant Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs Absent Members: McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Late Arrivals: None

Early Departures: Barham 6:55 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

1. None

П	П	K	O	П	D	\mathbf{B}	U	S	\mathbf{N}	D	K	X	O	U	O	\mathbf{R}	И	

1. Westfall 30 Monomoy Road Hardscaping: pool 54-210 CWA

Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Chip Webster, Chip Webster Architecture – Fence along road is wood.

Public None

Concerns (5:06) **Staff** – Read concerns from July 30, 2013.

Barham – Wood fence should transition to wire after a 24-foot return on the west. Would like the opening between

fence slats reduced to 2 inches.

Discussion about the wire portion of the fence.

Motion Motion to Approve through staff with the 4-foot high natural to weather wood fence along the road to have a

24-foot return on the west side with 2-inch spacing of the boards and the wire placed 5 feet in from the

property line on the west, north and east and tension wire along top to be black vinyl. (Barham)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60421

2. Minella, Amy 8 Gingy Lane Hardscaping 82-51 W. Yost

Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Representing William Yost – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.

Public None

Concerns (5:12) **Staff** – Read previous concerns from September 24.

Barham – The step is extremely high at 7 5/8"; the grade slopes 5.7 feet within 12 feet of the sidewalk. Stated he had asked for information about what was going on at the right corner of the property line; don't know if there is a retaining wall or not. Would like to see the contours of this and the neighboring house. Over by the parking, there is

only 3 feet from the porch and it looks to have an extreme slope.

Motion Motion to Hold for contour information on this and the property immediately to the east and the parking.

(Barham)

IV. NEW BUSINESS/AUTOMATIC VIEW RETURN ON 10/15/13

1. Bluefin Partners 16 Ellens Way Hardscaping: pool 81-6 Workshop/APD

Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None

Recused Hill-Holdgate

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns (5:32) **Barham** – Stated he was not able to view the projects. Stated that he had asked for the subdivision plans

showing all the approved buildings and pools and do not have those. Suggested that a better way to limit visibility of the pool is to move the fence tight to the pool, turn the pool north/south and move it more to the back of the property.

Coombs - Agrees.

Williams - All the pools are pretty much the same, with little to no patio and stuck behind the houses and garages

with wood fences.

Motion Motion to Hold for representation and a full subdivision plan showing all houses and pools. (Barham)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

2. Bluefin Partners 26 Ellens Way Hardscaping: pool 81-6 Workshop/APD

Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None

Recused Hill-Holdgate

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns (5:32) **Barham** – Was not able to view the projects. Noted that had asked for the subdivision plans showing all the

approved buildings and pools and do not have those. Suggested a better way to limit visibility of the pool is to move

the fence tight to the pool.

Coombs - Agrees.

Williams - All the pools are pretty much the same, with little to no patio and stuck behind the houses and garages

with wood fences.

Motion Motion to Hold for representation and a full subdivision plan showing all houses and pools. (Barham)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

3. Bluefin Partners 28 Ellens Way Hardscaping: pool 81-6 Workshop/APD

Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None

Recused Hill-Holdgate

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns (5:32) **Barham** – Was not able to view the projects. Noted that had asked for the subdivision plans showing all the

approved buildings and pools and do not have those. Suggested a better way to limit visibility of the pool is to move

the fence tight to the pool and moving the pool more to the back of the property.

Coombs - Agrees.

Williams – All the pools are pretty much the same, with little to no patio and stuck behind the houses and garages

with wood fences.

Motion Motion to Hold for representation and a full subdivision plan showing all houses and pools. (Barham)

4. Murray, John 4 Mikes Way New dwelling 66-76 Self

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing **John Murray**, owner – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (5:56) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – The way the garage is situated is atypical, but this is an unusual lot; for that reason, stated she has no

concerns.

Coombs – It is pretty well out of view. No concerns.

Barham - If it were visible, it would not be approvable. Would look nicer to move the garage to the southwest corner

and bring the master bedroom down to the first floor.

Williams – If the projecting "thing" were moved left, it would hide the garage door.

Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

5. Flannery, John 62 Wanoma Way Rev. COA 45355 92-16 Thorsen

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing **Christopher Lewis** – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (6:02) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

No concerns.

Motion Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60422

6. Weiss Carruthers 38 Burnell Street – SAB Hardscaping: solar panel 42.4.1-113 B. Meerbergen

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing **Brook Meerbergen** – Presented project. These sit about 1 inch off the roof. Do not want to consider running an array

on the ground.

Public None

Concerns (6:04) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

SAB – No concerns.

Coombs – Thinks visibility is minimal.

Hill-Holdgate – It isn't invisible, but it is well located and don't mind solar in this part of 'Sconset.

Barham – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate about solar in this part of 'Sconset. However, the guidelines say the panels should match the roof and these do not; also think there would be less visibility if it went onto the ground along the north property line. Argued that if the angle is reduced, that gives up 15% of the efficiency, which is less that being

given up by reducing the size of the roof array.

Williams – Tend to agree with Mr. Barham; these are not servicing the building they are on and they are very large. Agree the panel should match the color of the roof. If the front panel were eliminated, would have enough votes.

Discussion on the motion, whether or not they could work on the ground.

Motion Motion to Approve through staff with the eastern-most top and bottom panels removed. (Hill-Holdgate) Not carried

Motion to Hold for revisions heading to ground or wall mounting. (Barham) Not carried.

Motion to Approve through staff with the two eastern-most panels removed. (Coombs)

Vote Carried 3-1/Barham opposed Certificate # 60423

7. Bermingham 6 The Captains Lane New dwelling 30-619 W. Yost

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing William Yost – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (6:24) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Barham – Staircase to the basement on the south elevation is not shown on the plans, which are 5 feet from Paul Jones Road. Crown molding over the dormer window casing is atypical for that along with a crown or articulated molding on the eave; it is too much for a secondary structure; the projecting eave should pass in front of the corner board with a return. The crown molding and flying rakes are atypical together. The 6-over-6 windows would be more appropriate than 2-over-2 windows. The drop from the main mass to the secondary mass on the west elevation left is too hulking; the plate height should drop. It is not persuasive as a screened-in porch. The porch should not wrap around. South elevation, the shower should move away from the road. The drawing is as if the lot is flat and it isn't; need to know the topography. Need to know where the driveway will go. It's a lot of house for the lot and it should be moved back from both roads. Would like to see a locus that shows its relation to houses in the neighborhood.

Hill-Holdgate – West elevation, the front, the filled in porch isn't working: windows too short and porch is too shallow; the flush dormer trim is too heavy. The chimney should be interior, and the porch end with a post.

Coombs – Looks like a retaining wall would be necessary. Agree about the 6-over-6 windows being more in keeping with the window trim. East elevation, the back door is atypical.

Williams – It is too wide along the road; should be narrow and deep. Should sit 10 feet off Paul Jones Road and The

Captains Lane.

Motion Motion to Hold for revisions and further information on grading and topography. (Barham)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

8. Thirty-Nine Hulbert 39 Hulbert Avenue Rev. COA 59603: demo 29-19 Botticelli & Pohl

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (6:40) Discussion about including Brant Point older structures to the HSAB review list.

No concerns.

Motion Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60424

9. Thirty-Nine Hulbert 39 Hulbert Avenue New guest house 29-19 Botticelli & Pohl

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (6:45) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – It blocks too much of the house; it is too tall and too wide along the road and should not exceed 22

foot

Coombs – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. The south elevation faces the street and is very close to Hulbert Avenue

without a front door addressing the street.

Barham – From the north, there is a building very close which will obscure the gap between to two and will look like one building. It looks like the cottage roof matches the existing. The east face of the wall aligns with a bumpout on the house; it reads as all one house and does that successfully. The only thing that does not work is the little porch-shed roof looks cobbled onto to the bottom of the gambrel; it is not a nice resolution to that corner and the porch roof should go away.

Williams – Agree about the porch-shed roof. Replace the shingles with vertical boards across the foundation.

Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)

10. Mahoney, Tim 25 South Shore Road Additions, alterations 80-428 V. Oliver

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Val Oliver – Presented project.

Tim Mahoney

Public None

Concerns (6:56) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – The shed dormer on the south works, but the north elevation side gable dormers don't; those should

also be shed dormers.

Coombs – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate and don't like the ganged windows.

Motion Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation dormer to match the south elevation dormer. (Hill-

Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60425

Break 7:00 to 7:05

11. Taaffe, James 20 Boulevarde Hardscaping: pool 80-82 Thornewill Design

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Representing Carrie Thornewill, Thornewill Design – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (7:05) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Coombs – It is not visible.

Motion Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60426

12. Taaffe, James 20 Boulevarde Pool house 80-82 Thornewill Design

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Representing Carrie Thornewill, Thornewill Design – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (7:07) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Coombs – Think it would only be visible from Rainbow's end.

Hill-Holdgate – The white will make it stand out; should be natural to weather. Undecided about the Chimney.

Williams – South elevation chimney is inappropriate; should be a solid wall and the upper part brick.

Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

13. Desert Island LLC 11 Delaney Road (Lot 4) New dwelling 30-66 Thornewill Design

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns No discussion at this time.

Motion Motion to Hold for October 17 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)
Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

14. Desert Island LLC 15 Delaney Road New dwelling 30-66 Thornewill

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns No discussion at this time.

Motion Motion to Hold for October 17 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)
Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

15. Desert Island LLC 64 Cliff Lt 5 (13 Delaney) Partial demo/addition 30-66 Kaschuluk

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns No discussion at this time.

Motion Motion to Hold for October 17 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)
Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

16. Wood 11 Maxey Pond Rev.COA59643:structures 40-102 N. McMullen

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Nathan McMullen

Public None

Concerns (7:11) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

No concerns.

Motion Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60427

17. Wood 11 Maxey Pond Rev. COA 59644: scaping 40-102 N. McMullen

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Nathan McMullen

Public None

Concerns (7:12) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – Should be capped picket along the Wannacomet side.

Williams – Wire in privet is not appropriate.

Motion Motion to Approve through staff with the wooden natural to weather picket fence remaining on the N & S side

due to lack of minimal visibility. (Hill-Holdgate)

18. Sharer, Kevin 24 Bassett Road Hardscaping: fence, arbor 26-61 NAG

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None

Public Lucy Dillon, 18 & 20 Bassett Road – This is a rural Quaise road; the proposed deer fencing covers the entire lot and

is up to the road; currently there is a split rail fence. There is already fencing around the pool The proposed is too

gentrified and the grill is in the front of the property and would be visible from the road.

Concerns (7:16) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – Don't normally approve a fence encompassing the entire property.

Coombs – Agree.

Williams – Don't remember approving a "parking court."

Motion Motion to Hold for representation and clarification on the application. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

19. 9 Maxey Pond LLC 9 Maxey Pond Road New garage 40-103 Rowland Assoc.

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Representing Ben Normand, Rowland and Associates – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (7:25) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – The S elevation 2nd floor deck should have a shingled rail to blend in better. Bracket detail under the

porch roofs should be eliminated. The brackets over the garage door should be 45 degrees and straight.

Coombs - If the garage doors can be seen, they should not have glass. The deck faces the road; don't know if

shingling will help.

Williams – The garage doors and the deck facing the road are a problem. The 2nd-floor gable coming out of a 1-sotry

shed roof is atypical and inappropriate and it is over-scaled for the roof it is on.

Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

20. 9 Maxey Pond LLC 9 Maxey Pond Road New cottage 40-103 Rowland Assoc.

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Representing **Ben Normand**, Rowland and Associates – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (7:32) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – The front door is not appropriate; should be simple with no sidelights. The bay window is

inappropriate. The chimney owl is inappropriate. Porch columns are too small; they should match the other building.

At 24 feet, it is too tall for a secondary dwelling; should be 22 feet.

Coombs – Trim on the dormers is too heavy.

Williams – Don't like the dormers. The location is completely appropriate; no other structure is on Wannacomet

Road.

Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)

21. Reinemo, Karsten 14 Roberts Lane Hardscaping: steps, wall 56-24 K. Reinemo

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Karsten Reinemo, owner

Public None

Concerns (7:36) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

Hill-Holdgate – It is pink and an atypical Nantucket material. It would have to be tied to the screening plan. **Williams** – There will be Leland Cyprus and boxwood across the road to screen the view of the otherwise

inappropriate material. Suggested pargetting the stuff.

Motion Motion to Approve conditioned upon the landscape screening plan with year-round plants along the road, per

Exhibit A. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60429

22. Barrett, Peter 5 Hillers Lane Hardscaping: fence 42.3.2-118 D. Wiley

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Ben Normand, Rowland and Associates – Presented project.

Public None

Concerns (7:41) Discussion about whether or not the fence sits on a wall. Fence is at grade on the Barrett property.

Hill-Holdgate – It is unclear on the plan where the 6-foot fence drops down.

Coombs – Agrees with what's been said.

Williams – No scoop. The 6-foot section needs to start farther back.

Motion Motion to Approve through staff with 12 feet of a 2'8" solid board before changing to a 6-foot fence and the

gate squared off across the top. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60430

23. Sheffield / Velde 23 Jefferson Avenue Addition 30-49 Permits Plus

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns (7:47) **Staff** – Read application specifications.

No concerns.

Motion Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)

V. OLD BUSINESS

1. Schmid, Peter 9 E Street – MAB Revisions 42.4.1-14 Permits Plus

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Barham

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing Peter Schmid, owner

Public None

Concerns (5:39) **Staff** – Read previous concerns from August 6. Read an email from Mr. Poor.

Barham – Still have the same concerns. "Reduction in roof pitch helped. Extra space is attempted through enormous dormers that change the character of the building especially facing the water; it should have a pair of small dormers no larger than the windows they enclose. Agree the Ms Hill-Holdgate about the casements. The porch is open on two sides but glazed on the west with a picture window and pair of double-hung windows, which is atypical for Madaket; also the compilation of the picture window flanked by double-hung windows is odd. Vertical board used to run all the way around the house; proposing going from vertical board to picket along the water than back to vertical board."

Hill-Holdgate – There is a drafting error: the cornerboards were left off the dormer.

Williams – No concerns.

Motion Motion to Approve through staff with corrected drawings putting the corner boards back on the dormer. (Hill-

Holdgate)

Vote Carried 2-1/Barham opposed Certificate # 60432

2. 21 Lincoln Ave NT 21 Lincoln Avenue Rev. COA 59157:fenestration/deck 30-43 Botticelli & Pohl

Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns (5:46) **Staff** – Read previous concerns from October 10.

Barham – Okay with the north elevation 4-light French door. The change at 2nd story is inappropriate; the building

presents as it did 100 years ago and it should continue to do so. It is visible from the water.

Coombs – Agree, the porch is not appropriate.

Motion Motion to Approve through staff the 4-light French door on the north elevation but not the addition of the 2nd-

story deck due to its architectural inappropriateness for a structure of that era. (Barham)

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # 60433

3. Shuttleworth, Paul 112 Somerset Road Revisions: new dwelling 66-223 BPC

Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates None Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None Public None

Concerns (5:50) **Staff** – Read previous concerns from September 17.

Barham – There are a lot of revisions but they do not address the previous concerns.

Motion Motion to Hold for representation and the revisions as previously requested. (Barham)

Motion to Hold the following items for the Thursday, October 17 meeting due to lack of quorum. (Hill-

Н	lolc	lg	gate) (Carri	ied	unani	imo)	u	S	ly

4.	Fraker	12 Mt. Vernon St – HSAB	Revisions	55.4.1-35	Permits Plus
5.	Dolceamore	80 Washington St – HSAB	A/C condensers	42.2.3-201	Riley
6.	Hughes, Tom	107 Squam Road	Garage rev/elec. panel	12-60	Gina
7.	Sanford, Henry	14 Old N. Wharf – HSAB	Repair/replace sidewall	42.3.1-252	Twig Perkins
8.	Bazinet, Jason	15 Burnell Street – SAB	Revisions: house	73.4.2-48.1	D. Wiley
9.	Block-Kelley	3 Sherburne Tpk	New garage/studio	30-114	Botticelli & Pohl
10.	Brodie, Peter	70 Sankaty Road – SAB	Addition, alterations	49-81	V. Oliver
11.	Ribik, Joan	12 Chuck Hollow Road	Porch, door	72-79	V. Oliver
12.	Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: house	80-196	BPC
13.	Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: garage	80-196	BPC
14.	Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: cabana	80-196	BPC
15.	Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: pool	80-196	BPC
16.	Wesque Prop.LLC	5 N. Liberty St – HSAB	Move/addition	42.3.4-7	Emeritus
17.	Vogel	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Guest house	73-113	Emeritus
18.	Vogel	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Hardscaping: pool	73-113	Emeritus
19.	26 Gosnold Rd N.T.	26 Gosnold Road	Revisions: new dwelling	30-89	Botticelli & Pohl

VI. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes -	September 24 th , October 1 st , and 3 rd - Held
Review Minutes -	None
Other Business -	Organizational meeting October 29 th
	Letter of support to CPC regarding updating Building with Nantucket in Mind – Motion to have the chair
	write the letter of support for the commissioners' signatures. (Coombs) Carried unanimously
Commission Comments	

Motion to Adjourn: 7:54 p.m.

Submitted by: Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board
MAB – Madaket Advisory Board